



LAGOS STATE GOVERNMENT



## PRESS STATEMENT

Our attention has been drawn to recent concerns regarding certain information posted on the Lagos State Public Procurement Agency's website. Acknowledging the misunderstandings arising from a lack of clarity, we recognize the unintended misinterpretations of this information.

The Agency is committed to ensuring transparency, accuracy, and accountability in all government transactions, as mandated by the Lagos State Public Procurement Law. We regret that specific details, particularly concerning the descriptions of government dealings, may have inadvertently led to confusion, impacting both governmental entities and corporate partners providing services to the State. This arose largely from the lack of detailed descriptions in the project information, which has inadvertently led to confusion in the public space.

We empathize with public concerns and extend our sincere apologies for any distress caused. It's never our intent to cast doubt or cause misunderstandings that might tarnish the reputation of respected individuals and organizations involved in these transactions.

To address these concerns thoroughly, the Agency has taken immediate steps. Line-by-line explanations of the contracts in question are attached herewith, aiming to provide absolute clarity and dispel any lingering misconceptions.

The Agency will continue to improve its internal processes and communication methods as our commitment as a government is to offer clearer and more accessible information to the public. It is pivotal to stress that the Agency's autonomy exists to ensure fairness and transparency, not to cause confusion or discredit any involved parties. We therefore assure the public of our unwavering dedication to upholding the highest standards of integrity in all our operations. Looking ahead, we pledge our continued commitment to consistently and accurately report all government transactions in the State.

Our unwavering commitment remains to elevate the standard of living and enhancing the quality of life for the people of Lagos. Rest assured, this commitment will always take precedence.

Mr Fatai idowu Onafowote

The Director-General

Lagos State Public Procurement Agency

**LAGOS STATE PUBLIC PROCUREMENT AGENCY**

The Secretariat, Block 22/23, Obafemi Awolowo Way, Alausa, Ikeja, Lagos.

E-mail: [info@lagosppa.gov.ng](mailto:info@lagosppa.gov.ng) Website: [www.lagosppa.gov.ng](http://www.lagosppa.gov.ng)



**LAGOS STATE PUBLIC PROCUREMENT AGENCY'S REACTION TO THE OPEN LETTER BY MR FUNSO DOHERTY**

**STATING THE FACTS AND FIGURES**

SN	MDA	DESCRIPTION OF AWARD	NAIRA AMOUNT	DATE	VENDOR	COMMENTS	RESPONSE FROM LAGOS STATE GOVERNMENT
1.	Lagos Metropolitan Area Transport Authority (LAMATA)	Construction, Supply & Installation of Operation and Maintenance (O&M) Infrastructure of LRMT Blue Line Phase 1 from Marina to Mile 2	40,188,644,336	Apr-23	China Civil Engineering Construction Company (CCECC) Nigeria Limited	<p>The Blue Line was planned to be operated and maintained by a qualified and competent operator on a PPP basis. This arrangement is not in place, but train operations have started.</p> <p>Who is performing that function presently and who will manage, operate and maintain this Operations and Maintenance (O&amp;M) Infrastructure that is now being procured by LASG from the main contractor (CCECC) at a cost of N40bn? Is it LAMATA? If so, does it have the capacity? How are safety, efficiency, accountability and financial results being assured, monitored and reported?</p>	<p>The Blue Line Rail Project's design and construction were entrusted to Messr CCECC Nigeria Limited. Subsequently, upon finalizing the fixed infrastructure, a two-year partial operation contract was executed with the contractor for the following purposes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ bolster the technical and operational expertise of LAMATA's teams, fostering their capacity.</li> <li>▪ meticulously gather scientific financial and revenue data essential for informed decision-making processes.</li> <li>▪ equip pertinent practitioners with the necessary information crucial for forthcoming concessioning procedures.</li> <li>▪ empower the contractor to promptly address any defects identified during the operational phase of the project.</li> </ul>
2.		Construction of Lagos Rail Mass Transit (LRMT) blue line Mile 2 to Okokomaiko (section 2)	218,071,301,485	Jul-23	China Civil Engineering Construction Company (CCECC) Nigeria Limited	<p>In 2008, N70bn was approved for the Blue line and it was expected to be completed by 2011. Phase 1 of the project, Marina to Mile 2, which is approximately half of the total proposed length, has just recently commenced limited operations in 2023. The overall cost incurred so far has not been disclosed. With this award of Phase 2 by LASG to the same contractor, at a cost of N218n, what</p>	<p>Phase 1 faced significant delays due to insufficient funds. The current administration's strategy successfully realized the Blue Line Rail Project. The Governor remains dedicated to completing section 2 during this term, employing the same approach used for phase 1. Section 2 has already been entrusted to Messr CCECC Nigeria Limited, seamlessly continuing the project with ongoing execution. In a commendable move, the Lagos State Government compensated verified property</p>

						safeguards are in place to prevent a repeat occurrence?	owners and tenants, following a globally accepted standard—a practice that will continue as needed.
3.		Consultancy Service for the update of the strategic Transport and Mobility Master Plan for Lagos Mega City Area	5,380,695,140	Sep-23	Advanced Engineering Consultants (AEC) / ROM Transportation Engineering	Advanced Engineering Consultants (AEC) and ROM Transportation have been engaged to update the Strategic Transport and Mobility Master Plan (STMP) at a cost of approximately N5.5bn. However, the same company, AEC is also engaged by LASG in implementing multiple aspects of the STMP. They have been awarded contracts for the Bus Corridors (see below), as well as the design of the fourth Mainland Bridge. It is not good practice and is a conflict of interest to engage a participating contractor with a vested interest in specific design or implementation contracts to develop or update the master plan	<p>The Consultancy Service for updating the Strategic Transport and Mobility Master Plan for the Lagos Mega City Area was awarded to Messrs. ROM Transportation Engineering Ltd in collaboration with Advanced Engineering Consultants (AEC) after a rigorous 15-month competitive procurement process led by LAMATA, AFD, and PPA. The awarded contract, valued at ₦1,167,451,900.54 plus €4,213,243.24, spans 24 months.</p> <p>While ROM Transportation Engineering Ltd serves as the principal consultant, AEC, as the local partner, facilitates engagement with various stakeholders and facilitates knowledge transfer. It's essential to differentiate between the STMMMP and EPCS contracts: the former involves upgrading the existing STMP to guide the Lagos State Government on transportation infrastructure development, whereas the latter pertains to implementing recommendations from the current STMP and is financed by AFD.</p>
4.		Consultancy Service for the detailed engineering design and supervision of construction of quality bus corridor package 1 (Ketu/Alapere, Yaba-Lawanson-Cele), Package 2 (Iju Ishaga-Abule Egba) and Package 3 (Iyana-Iba-Igando)	7,361,406,710	May-23	Advanced Engineering Consultants (AEC) / GPO Group SA	See above. AEC appears to be a recurring feature across a number of very substantial LASG/LAMATA contract awards. It is not apparent from evidence in the public domain that projects AEC has undertaken, outside of LASG projects, justify the prominence accorded it by LASG. Remarkably, recently, in Sept 2023, the current Federal Minister of Works announced a proposed Lagos-Abuja "Super-Highway" intended to operate on a concessioned, PPP basis and	The Detailed Engineering Design and Construction Supervision procurement for Quality Bus Corridor Package 1, 2 & 3 commenced in December 2019, culminating in the award to AEC/GPO S.A. in September 2021. Subsequently, the contract underwent revision to incorporate an Intelligent Transportation System (ITS) component. After finalizing this process, a revised award was officially issued in April 2023, following thorough certification by AFD.



		Including design and supervision of ITS for 4 Nos of quality bus corridors.				presented AEC as the entity that would lead the consortium to partner with the FGN	
5.		Consultancy Services for the engagement of Loan Facilitator and Adviser on LRMT blue line project	2,101,321,622	May-23	Iroko Capital	This award should be scrutinized for Value-for-Money. LASG should not be engaging consultants for this purpose at a high fixed cost. If deemed necessary, a modest engagement retainer (a fraction of this amount) combined with a more substantive fee that is contingent and payable upon successful fundraising, commercial and financial close should be negotiated through a competitive selection process.	The consultant played a key role in securing funding for the Blue and Red Lines through local Nigerian banks, a shift from the initial plan of acquiring a USD loan from the international community. This strategic move mitigated the State's exposure to exchange rate risks. Negotiating the fee down from 5% to 2.5% was another achievement. The operational Blue Line stands as a testament to the successful completion of the project within the stipulated timeframe, showcasing its numerous associated benefits. The decision averted the risks associated with fluctuating exchange rates, ensuring stability and fostering favorable outcomes from the investment.
6.		Consultancy Services for the engagement of Loan transaction arranger and Financial Adviser to LASG/LAMATA on the Red line project	3,141,666,667	May-23	Iroko Capital	Ditto	The consultant played a key role in securing funding for the Blue and Red Lines through local Nigerian banks, a shift from the initial plan of acquiring a USD loan from the international community. This strategic move mitigated the State's exposure to exchange rate risks. Negotiating the fee down from 5% to 2.5% was another achievement. The operational Blue Line stands as a testament to the successful completion of the project within the stipulated timeframe, showcasing its numerous associated benefits. The decision averted the risks associated with fluctuating exchange rates, ensuring stability and fostering favorable outcomes from the investment.
7.	Ministry of Works and Infrastructure	Rehabilitation / Reconstruction/ upgrade of Eti-Osa / Lekki / Epe	69,936,201,915	Aug-23	Craneburg Construction	This single award for the repair and upgrade of a section of an already existing road amounts to approximately half of the entire 2023	The contractor who has previously been prequalified was already engaged in on-site operations, specifically focusing on the road infrastructure starting from the T junction in

		Expressway (Phase 2b) from Greensprings to Abraham Adesanya in Eti-Osa and Ibeju-Lekki LGA				budget for the Ministry of Works and Infrastructure. A comprehensive and preferably independent, value-for-money assessment should be done for this contract. Also see additional comment below.	the Epe axis. Notably, the road structure is primarily concrete-based, and the contractor has initiated the project using its internal financial resources for up to 50% of cost. Subsequent disbursement of funds by the LASG is planned to span across over 24months utilizing an ISPO. Moreover, the BOQ pertinent to this project has undergone thorough assessment and scrutiny by the Office of Infrastructure to ensure accuracy and appropriateness in line with the project's scope and specifications.
8.		Construction of identified strategic roads across the state in Alimosho LGA (2 Roads), Ikeja LGA (3 Roads), Ifako Ijaiye LGA (6 Roads) and Kosofe LGA (4 Roads) (Lot 3)	6,047,509,151	Sep-23	LagField Construction Limited	This is one of 3 large contract awards to 3 contractors with multiple roads per local Government in each award. Based on our experience in Lagos, apart from quality and value-for-money considerations, commuter experience during construction must be considered and prioritized. Work should be properly phased having regard to LASG's funding capacity. Contractor plans to mitigate hardship and disruption must form part of the contract and must be jointly agreed, monitored and enforced. LASG should also, even as it awards additional road contracts, address the several unfinished and dilapidated roads and road projects on key arteries across the State that are contributing to traffic gridlock, crime, health conditions and reduced quality of life	The BOQ underwent comprehensive evaluation conducted by Office of Infrastructure, ensuring meticulous scrutiny and validation of the project's quantitative aspects. Simultaneously, the Ministry of Transportation remains actively engaged in project oversight. This involvement facilitates the implementation of necessary traffic diversions, supported by the deployment of traffic officers at strategic locations to guarantee uninterrupted traffic flow during project execution.  Payment disbursement for projects adheres to a certified measured works framework, ensuring that the total allocated sum is not released in a single transaction. Instead, payments are processed incrementally based on certified progress, with an initial advance payment set at 40% of the total project cost.  Regarding the restoration of deteriorated roads, the Lagos State Government's Public Works Corporation shoulders the responsibility of rectifying such infrastructural deficiencies. The Corporation is well-equipped and proficiently positioned to execute this mandate, ensuring

							the effective rehabilitation of dilapidated road networks across the state.
9.	Ministry of Energy and Mineral Resources	Procurement and Construction and Design, Build Operate and Maintain PPP Model for the Blueline Rail	9,714,179,610	Sep-23	Lamp Turnkey Project / Viathan Engineering Limited	<p>This relates to an Independent Power Plant proposed to power the Blue Line Rail on a Design, Build, Operate and Maintain PPP Model. This was originally intended to be financed by the concessionaire. From this award, it now appears that the setup cost is being borne by LASG. The award makes reference to a PPP, but it is not evident that a PPP process has been advertised, undertaken or disclosed by the LASG PPP Office. It is therefore not clear on what basis this N9.7 bn contract was awarded, whether a concession is involved and what terms are provided for.</p>	<p>During the initial stages of project conceptualization, the contractor was tasked with executing the project under a Public-Private Partnership (PPP) framework entailing the Build, Operate, Maintain, and Transfer model. Following due process, the contractor successfully secured the project bid. However, it became imperative to develop a comprehensive and detailed design to accurately estimate the project cost. Design considerations constitute a substantial segment, accounting for approximately 15% of the overall project expenditure.</p> <p>In the pursuit of facilitating the PPP arrangement, financial backers stipulated the requirement for a Fiscally Backed Irrevocable Standing Payment Order (ISPO) supported by the Federation Account Allocation Committee (FAAC). Regrettably, the Lagos State Government (LASG) was unable to comply with this condition. Given the critical timing and significance of the project, LASG made a strategic decision to independently finance the Engineering, Procurement, and Construction (EPC) component of the project.</p> <p>This intervention proved pivotal, expediting the project's progress significantly, particularly in advancing the power plant construction phase to an advanced stage. Notably, while the entirety of the project remains under the PPP framework, this specific segment was funded by the State owing to the exigencies of the project timeline and its strategic importance.</p>

10.	Lagos State Residents Registration Agency	Provision of Support Services for the Multi-biometric search service (MBSS) platform for the deployment of disaster recovery site and upgrade of Database infrastructure from 10M to 20M to the agency.	7,991,930,559	Jul-23	Identiko Integrated Solution Limited	This single award of approximately N8 billion is to a single vendor. In comparison, the entire 2023 expenditure budget for this agency, LASRRA, is about N3.2bn. This award alone is about two and a half times the entire 2023 LASRRA budget and calls for greater scrutiny.	The Project extends across a duration of three years, necessitating funds to be allocated across multiple budget cycles rather than sourced from a single fiscal period. Notably, this initiative serves as a continuation of an ongoing contract, encompassing the augmentation of services to integrate a disaster recovery site within its scope.
11.	Special Committee on Rehabilitation of Public Schools	Various	5,813,169,527	Various	Various	These relate to various awards over the six-month period, by the Special Committee on Rehabilitation of Schools (SCRPS). Conceived as an intervention mechanism, it is not clear what the current legal framework for SCRPS is. It is listed under the Ministry of Education, but has a distinct budget and appears to operate with semi-autonomous MDA-like status, awarding and overseeing substantial contracts. It is important that its activities be subjected to review, oversight and periodic audit.	SCRPS was re-established by Mr Governor with an Executive Order on the 4th of Nov 2019. Having existed and operated by previous Administrations, it was re-introduced as a committee with the primary mandate to address the decay in the physical infrastructure in public schools. They work with the Ministry of Education for proper project identification and justification. SCRPS is subject to both State audit and external audit and other internal monitoring Agencies. They follow the State PPA laws on contract award up to project close out. All payments are executed from the State Treasury Office, after due certification by other monitoring State Agencies.
12.	Lagos State Infrastructure Asset Management Agency	Various	4,289,471,036	Various	Various	The existing model where facility management contracts are awarded and managed by LASIAMA while individual, geographically dispersed MDAs occupy and use the facilities requires careful design and diligent implementation of incentives, feedback mechanisms, risk and consequence management to ensure satisfactory, safe and efficient operations. Both LASIAMA and the	LASIAMA, operating within the mandate of managing Lagos State assets and infrastructure plays a pivotal role in streamlining facility management across the state. The prevailing model, wherein LASIAMA administers facility management contracts while various MDAs occupy and utilize these facilities, is a strategic approach designed to centralize and optimize resource utilization. This model facilitates a cohesive and standardized management

						third-party facility managers are service providers to the MDAs and must deliver or bear consequences. If it is to be retained, this operating structure should be reviewed across the board and must include an effective performance management framework for LASIAMA.	framework, ensuring uniform standards of maintenance and efficient resource allocation.
13.	Office of the Chief of Staff	Supply and distribution of 2,000 Noiler Chicken across the local government areas and wards in the state	18,468,000	May-23	Seed and Seedlings Agricultural Enterprises	It is not clear why the Office of the Chief of Staff should be engaged in supplying and distributing Chickens across the state.	This falls under the socio-political responsibilities of government to cater for its citizens
14.		Procurement of a brand new Lexus LX 600 Bullet Proof Sport Utility Vehicle for use in the Pool of Office of Chief of Staff	440,750,000	Jun-23	Lakeside Investment Limited	This appears excessive and is out-of-tune with both the prevailing economic circumstances and mood of the people. It should be scrutinized as to the need and justification for such a vehicle purchase and also value for money	This is in tandem with current economic realities.
15.		Replacement of the liquid fragrance in the Office of Mr Governor, Lagos House, Ikeja.	7,475,000	Jun-23	ARC44 Global Enterprises	On the face of it, and especially in the present economic circumstances, the amount of this award appears excessive in relation to the item procured.	This covers the entire 2023 period of one year. It is also not limited to Mr Governor's office but extends to several offices and state houses.
16.		Decoration of Venue for Political Delegates Congress	20,804,550	Jun-23	Equally Diverse Solutions	Official Government Funds should not be used for political expenses.	This was a strategic programme aimed at fostering interaction and collaboration between elected legislators and members of the State Executive Council. Its objective was to provide a conducive environment that encouraged dialogue, exchange of ideas, and cohesive engagement among these stakeholders.
17.		Flying Hour Expenses on Ad-hoc	400,000,000	Jul-23	Caverton Helicopters	This should be scrutinized as to the need and justification for such	This payment accounts for past services rendered, wherein outstanding debts owed to



		Charter Plane by Lagos State Government				substantial cost at taxpayer's expense and also value-for-money.	the contractor is being reconciled and offset by this specific figure.
18.		Flying Hour Expenses on Ad-hoc Charter Plane by Lagos State Government	112,500,000	Aug-23	Caverton Helicopters	This should be scrutinized as to the need and justification for such substantial cost at taxpayer's expense and also value-for-money.	This payment accounts for past services rendered, wherein outstanding debts owed to the contractor is being reconciled and offset by this specific figure.
19.		Procurement of TEN (10) UNITS brand new Hyundai County Buses for use in the Pool of the Office of the Chief of Staff	600,000,006	Aug-23	VON Automobile Nigeria Limited	it is not evident why there is a need to purchase 30 brand new buses at a total cost of N2.2 billion for use in the pool of the Office of the Chief of Staff	The Chief of Staff holds oversight responsibilities across multiple MDAs within the State. However, it's important to note that these buses are designated for the use of other MDAs within the State and are not allocated for the personal use of the Chief of Staff.
20.		Procurement of TWENTY (20) UNITS brand new Ashok Leyland Falcon Buses for use in the Pool of the Office of the Chief of Staff	1,599,999,986	Aug-23	VON Automobile Nigeria Limited	Ditto	The Chief of Staff holds oversight responsibilities across multiple MDAs within the State. However, it's important to note that these buses are designated for the use of other MDAs within the State and are not allocated for the personal use of the Chief of Staff.
21.	Office of the Deputy Governor	Monthly outreach of indigent citizens by wife of the Deputy Governor	30,000,000	Jul-23	Rodies Logistics	Though the intention may be laudable, these should not be funded from the budget of the Office of the Deputy Governor	This amount represents an annual sum, with a monthly expenditure of N2.5 million.
22.		Monthly empowerment programmes of the wife of the deputy governor	30,000,000	Jul-23	Rodies Logistics	Ditto	This amount represents an annual sum, with a monthly expenditure of N2.5 million.
23.		Provision of Supply items (Rechargeable fans, rechargeable lights and fridge in	2,017,840.00	Jul-23	Judkom Enterprises	This award, which is listed here as published by the PPA, very obviously deserves further scrutiny.	This is not the case. The contract is for N2,017,840.00 and this is what is contained on the Agency's website and the registered Letter of Award.

		the office of the deputy governor.					
24.	Ministry of Finance	Collation of Revenue Data and the Review of the current Lagos State Revenue Allocation Indices in Line with Revenue Mobilization Allocation and Fiscal Commission Call Circular	778,000,000	May-23	DYA Lorte Limited	Maintenance and reporting of State revenue and expenditure data is a fundamental, long-standing and core responsibility of the Ministries of Finance and Economic Planning and Budget. Why there is a need for additional expenditure of this magnitude to meet reporting requirements is not clear. It requires further justification as it may be indicative of other capacity gaps that may need to be addressed.	The core objective of this project is to conduct a comprehensive reassessment of Lagos State, aligning it with the standards set forth by the Revenue Mobilization Allocation and Fiscal Commission. This initiative necessitates extensive data collection conducted by local government officials at their respective levels. As a result of the time constraints faced by LASG, a consultant was engaged. The project entails training, meticulous data analysis, and oversight by the commission to evaluate the ongoing efforts.
25.	Ministry of Agriculture	Commission and Operation Start-Off support of Lagos Rice Mill Imota.	300,000,000	May-23	Messrs WACOT Agro Ventures Limited	LASG announced in October 2022 that it signed an agreement for WACOT to manage the Imota Rice Mill which was built at substantial cost to the taxpayer. The terms of this arrangement have not been disclosed, but LASG continues to also directly bear costs associated with running the Mill. It should be clear and unambiguous who bears what responsibilities and there should be monitoring and reporting to ensure accountability, operating efficiency and financial sustainability. Further, if the terms of the agreement bring it within the ambit of the PPP law, then the arrangement should be disclosed, regulated, monitored and reported on by the Office of PPP	The collaboration with WACOT is not a Public-Private Partnership (PPP) but a technical service arrangement intended to bolster the Imota Rice Mill. This partnership involves the provision of expertise from both expatriate and local staff, leveraging their experience in similar machinery and processes from Argungu, Kebbi State. It's crucial to note that the mill remains the property of LASG; the collaboration primarily focuses on training. WACOT has deployed 7 expatriates and 16 support staff to facilitate the initial operations and eventual self-sufficiency of the mill. The initial allocation of 300 million Naira was intended for disbursement at 50 million Naira monthly over a six-month period. However, due to an expanded scope, this figure has been revised to 540 million Naira, allowing for a monthly disbursement of 60 million Naira for further 9 months totalling 15 months.
26.		Renewal/Extension of Technical Support Services for the	540,000,000	Jul-23	Messrs WACOT Agro Ventures Limited	Ditto	The collaboration with WACOT is not a Public-Private Partnership (PPP) but a technical service arrangement intended to bolster the Imota Rice Mill. This partnership involves the

		Management of Operations of Lagos Rice Mill Imota					provision of expertise from both expatriate and local staff, leveraging their experience in similar machinery and processes from Argungu, Kebbi State. It's crucial to note that the mill remains the property of LASG; the collaboration primarily focuses on training. WACOT has deployed 7 expatriates and 16 support staff to facilitate the initial operations and eventual self-sufficiency of the mill. The initial allocation of 300 million Naira was intended for disbursement at 50 million Naira monthly over a six-month period. However, due to an expanded scope, this figure has been revised to 540 million Naira, allowing for a monthly disbursement of 60 million Naira for further 9 months totalling 15 months.
27.		Procurement of Consumables like Threads, Charcoal, Wood, Sand, Personal protective equipment, hiring of trucks and servicing of generator plants for the second quarter operation of Lagos Rice Mill Imota.	24,721,650	Jun-23	Lamin Global Ventures Limited	Ditto	The contractor's proven expertise in supplying these consumables led to the establishment of a framework agreement, enabling the consistent provision of these items over an extended period.
28.	Fire Service	Procure Fuel for the State Fire and Rescue Service's Operational Activities	850,755,000	Jun-23	Deoban 3 Plus Ltd	Procurement of Fuel by the State should be rationalized. The State should negotiate directly for bulk product purchases from the major petroleum product marketing companies. It may then use smaller contractors for the related logistical services, fulfillment and for limited supplementary product purchases, if and when required. LASG should also	Procuring fuel for Fire Service in this manner aligns with the state's public procurement goals which includes encouraging SME involvement. Involving smaller contractors supports SME participation and ensures operational flexibility. The contract is payable monthly at N70million and covers 20 fire stations.

						maintain appropriate levels of strategic reserve	
29.	Lagos State Lotteries and Gaming Authority	Implementation of Feasibility Study for Lekki-Epe International Airport	195,000,000	Apr-23	Amion Projects Limited	Substantial costs are being incurred by the Lagos State Lotteries and Gaming Authority far above the revenues it is generating for wide-ranging and disparate purposes. As at September, the Authority's 2023 revenues were reported at approximately N3.3bn and expenditure at approximately N11.4bn. This contradicts the rationale for the existence of the Authority and should be examined.	The dwindling revenue cannot be substantiated and does not reflect the true position at Lotteries Board. The enabling law creating the Board empowers it to allocate funds for expenditure relating to certain objectives including educational, infrastructural, health care and environmental objectives.
30.		Restoration of Water Supply at Iduganran Palace	152,116,326	Sep-23	PEEC Transational Limited	Ditto	The dwindling revenue cannot be substantiated and does not reflect the true position at Lotteries Board. The enabling law creating the Board empowers it to allocate funds for expenditure relating to certain objectives including educational, infrastructural, health care and environmental objectives.
31.		Proposed Adesalu Health Care Center at Onasa Community Ibeju-Lekki	159,314,907	Sep-23	PEEC Transational Limited	Ditto	The dwindling revenue cannot be substantiated and does not reflect the true position at Lotteries Board. The enabling law creating the Board empowers it to allocate funds for expenditure relating to certain objectives including educational, infrastructural, health care and environmental objectives.
32.	Lagos State Parking Authority	Procurement of 40 Nos of Vehicle Tyre Clamps 1st Batch for the Agency	9,589,000	Jun-23	Baldwin Investment Limited	Some of the reported actions of this agency are suggestive of an agency that is under pressure to generate revenues, whose revenue model is not fully thought through and whose enforcement tactics may be predatory. This could be further fuelled by the fact that it is operating at a substantial deficit. For the year to September	The figures provided lack substantiation and the source is unreliable. Without verified financial data, making assumptions about the agency's revenue generation, operational model, or enforcement strategies leads to flawed conclusions



						2023, it had revenues of N450million and had incurred costs of N2.4 billion.	
33.		Engagement of the consultancy on operations management monitoring and customer tools for Lagos State parking authority	405,456,363	Jul-23	Automata Technologies System Limited	Ditto	The figures provided lack substantiation and the source is unreliable. Without verified financial data, making assumptions about the agency's revenue generation, operational model, or enforcement strategies leads to flawed conclusions
34.	Lagos State Electricity Board	Supply of Transformers and Electricity Accessories	36,367,366	Jun-23	Omron Nigeria Limited	As at September, the Lagos State Electricity Board had a large deficit with revenues reported for 2023 of N34 million and expenditure for the same period of N19 billion of which N5.8bn was for capital expenditure and N13.3bn for overheads. It acquires, operates and maintains generation and distribution assets to power mostly public and underserved facilities. Government has historically been shown to be inefficient in the management of such operations and where possible, transition to efficient private operators on commercial, competitive terms should be pursued. Where there are compelling reasons for Government to continue to operate these services, the related activities, costs, efficiency metrics and results of operations must be tracked, benchmarked and transparently reported.	The Lagos State Electricity Board functions as a pivotal agency overseeing various aspects of electricity provision and regulation within the state. Its primary responsibilities encompass power distribution oversight, infrastructure development, policy formulation, and implementation related to electricity generation, transmission, and distribution. Additionally, the board addresses consumer services, handling complaints, ensuring affordable access to reliable electricity, and conducting consumer education programs. It plays a regulatory role in tariffs, licensing, and quality standards for electricity services while promoting the integration of renewable energy sources into the state's electricity supply. The importance of LSEB can therefore not be over-emphasized. In addition, the overhead of LSEB is expended on streetlights, diesel, payment for IPPs etc.
35.		Rehabilitation and reconnection of IPP high voltage distribution	599,980,515	Sep-23	Mainland Power Limited	Ditto	The Lagos State Electricity Board functions as a pivotal agency overseeing various aspects of electricity provision and regulation within the state. Its primary responsibilities encompass

		network from ile zik to oshodi					power distribution oversight, infrastructure development, policy formulation, and implementation related to electricity generation, transmission, and distribution. Additionally, the board addresses consumer services, handling complaints, ensuring affordable access to reliable electricity, and conducting consumer education programs. It plays a regulatory role in tariffs, licensing, and quality standards for electricity services while promoting the integration of renewable energy sources into the state's electricity supply. The importance of LSEB can therefore not be over-emphasized. In addition, the overhead of LSEB is expended on streetlights, diesel, payment for IPPs etc.
36.	Ministry of Home Affairs	Renovation of Saint Andrews Anglican Church, Oke-Popo, Lagos	531,553,559	Aug-23	VicJone Nigeria Limited	Why is LASG spending N531 million of taxpayer money to renovate a Church?	The Church was founded in 1889 and stands as a significant historical landmark in Lagos State. The need for the State to preserve such landmark can therefore not be overemphasized. The contract amount encompasses funds allocated for both the refurbishment of the Church and compensation given to the church for the necessary demolition of sections of its property due to road expansion.
37.	Center for Rural Development	Construction of Erelu Way / Dayo Eluk Community Link Road, in Amikanle Community the Agbado-Oke Odo LCDA	511,539,758	Sep-23	People's Choice Properties Ltd	The Center for Rural Development was conceived to focus on research, programmatic and policy interventions to help catalyze rural development across the state. CERUD's entire budget for 2023 is N1.3 billion. By comparison, this single award is for N551 million. CERUD should not be directly engaged in the building of roads.	CERUD's mandate encompasses providing essential amenities to rural areas, and the project spans across multiple budget cycles.
38.	Lagos State Public Procurement	On-boarding of four MDAs and Twenty-nine Hospitals unto	379,500,000	Jul-23	Kehinde Kassim & Co.	There should be an additional oversight and control mechanism for significant procurement awards of the	the Lagos State Public Procurement Agency operates under a governance framework that ensures rigorous oversight and control

	Agency	the E-procurement system of Lagos State Public Procurement Agency				Public Procurement Agency, as the procurement police should not be left alone to police itself.	mechanisms beyond its internal procurement policies. The agency's activities are subject to meticulous scrutiny and audit processes conducted by both the Lagos State House of Assembly and the Office of the Auditor General.
39.	Ministry of Economic Planning and Budget	Consultancy Services for the engagement of monitoring and evaluation specialist for NG-CARES Implementation in Lagos State	315,600,000	Jul-23	Duke Advisory Service	The wisdom in spending a sum as significant as this in 2023 for monitoring and evaluation of a COVID-19 recovery programme is suspect especially in light of the prevailing economic hardship. M&E should have been part of the original implementation of NG-CARES. This award should be scrutinized for value for money and/or better alternative uses at the present time.	This is a world bank project under the Program-for-Results (PforR) financing instrument. Its unique features include linking disbursement of funds to the achievement of specific program results and supporting clients in enhancing the effectiveness and efficiency of their development programs to achieve tangible and sustainable results. The project is currently ongoing in all 36 States of the federation.
40.	Ministry of Physical Planning and Urban Development	Public Relations and Whistleblower strategy for the ministry of physical planning and urban development	269,000,000	Jul-23	6334 Business Services	This should be reviewed and assessed to ensure Value-for-money.	The project involved a comprehensive nine-month enumeration and sensitization campaign conducted by the consultant throughout Lagos State. This initiative also involved the engagement of diverse stakeholders within the informal sector, with a primary focus on augmenting data collection, fostering community awareness, and promoting regulatory compliance.
41.	Office of Internal Audit	Transformation Agenda for Office of Internal Audit	100,000,000	Jul-23	Marina Consulting Limited	This is quite vague. It should be reviewed and assessed to provide assurance of Value-for-money	This was an extensive capacity building programme for all Auditors statewide and a process re-engineering drive.
42.		Capacity building and Competency Framework for Office of Internal Audit	100,000,000	Jun-23	Dayclar Global Ventures	This contract, for capacity building and a competency framework for the Office of Internal Audit, is recorded by the PPA as being awarded to Dayclar Global Ventures, which defines itself as a real estate company.	The consultant, with a wealth of experience in works projects, was enlisted to conduct statewide training for auditors. The focus was on imparting prepayment inspection protocol expertise alongside comprehensive project management skills.

43.	Office of the Head of Service	Procurement of 5 (Five) Brand New 2023 Mikano Changan Dynamic Saloon Vehicles for 5 lucky winners in the senior category during the recently concluded Y2023 Public Service Week.	83,796,250	Aug-23	Mikano International Limited	It is ill-advised to do a raffle draw where 5 new vehicles are given out free with public funds. One vehicle would suffice for this purpose. LASG should instead focus on ensuring public servants are well compensated and then held accountable for efficient service delivery	The distribution of 5 vehicles during the Public Service Week aimed to recognize senior civil servants' dedication and boost morale. The goal of this gesture, is to foster productivity among public servants.
44.	Lagos State Emergency Management Agency	Procurement of Fuel for Lagos State Emergency Management Agency Operational Activities for the Month of April	74,524,650	Apr-23	Messrs Aderinola Oyindamola Aboyade-Cole & Co.	Procurement of Fuel by the State should be rationalized. The State should negotiate directly for bulk product purchases from the major petroleum product marketing companies. It may then use smaller contractors for the related logistical services, fulfillment and for limited supplementary product purchases, if and when required. LASG should also maintain appropriate levels of strategic reserve.	Procuring fuel for LASEMA in this manner aligns with the state's public procurement goals which includes encouraging SME involvement. Involving smaller contractors supports SME participation and ensures operational flexibility.
45.	Ibile Oil and Gas Corporation	Renovation of IOGC's Retail Fuel Station Located at Km 44 Lekki-Epe Expressway Ikota-Lekki, Lagos	68,000,000	Jul-23	Elsatech Nigeria Limited	IOGC continues to operate with a substantial budget deficit though its detailed financial results are not published. It is unlikely to be efficient and competitive in retail fuel distribution and LASG is in effect engaging in competition with businesses, including small businesses, that it should instead be supporting. The State should focus on doing what a government should do. The IOGC station at Ikota is not a busy station and has changed hands a couple of times in the last 5 years with IOGC being the latest acquirer. Yet, not	The renovation of IOGC's retail fuel station aligns with LASG's role as a major shareholder in the organization. It's a contribution towards improving infrastructure within the state, not a competition with private businesses. LASG is committed to enhancing services for the public and addressing separate challenges like road works and traffic through other initiatives.



						far down the road from the same IOGC Station are dilapidated and abandoned road works causing severe traffic daily on this critical and rapidly growing axis	
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--